



## Hudson-Bergen Light Rail (HBLR) Route 440 Extension–Alternatives Analysis

### FINAL Evaluation of Alternatives Report

Project Sponsor:

**NJ TRANSIT**

One Penn Plaza East  
Newark, New Jersey 07105-2246  
973-491-7000



Prepared by:

AKRF, Inc.

BEM Systems, Inc.

BET Engineering Consultants, Inc.

Gannett Fleming Engineers and Architects, PC

InGroup, Inc.

JCMS, Inc.

RES Advisors

Technquest Corporation

February 2011

## Table of Contents

---

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Chapter 1: Background and Planning Context .....</b> | <b>1-1</b> |
| 1.0 Introduction .....                                  | 1-1        |
| 1.1 Overview of HBLR System.....                        | 1-1        |
| 1.2 Project Location .....                              | 1-3        |
| 1.2.1 Existing Transit Services.....                    | 1-3        |
| 1.2.2 Future Development Plans .....                    | 1-3        |
| 1.2.3 Travel Market.....                                | 1-4        |
| 1.2.4 Environmental Setting .....                       | 1-5        |
| 1.2.4.1 Land Use .....                                  | 1-5        |
| 1.2.4.2 Social Conditions.....                          | 1-6        |
| 1.2.4.3 Natural Resources.....                          | 1-7        |
| 1.3 Problem Identification .....                        | 1-7        |
| 1.3.1 Existing Transit Service .....                    | 1-9        |
| 1.3.2 Mobility.....                                     | 1-9        |
| 1.3.3 Future Development.....                           | 1-10       |
| 1.3.4 Pedestrian Safety .....                           | 1-10       |
| 1.4 Purpose and Need.....                               | 1-11       |
| 1.5 Goals and Objectives .....                          | 1-11       |
| <b>Chapter 2: Analysis Framework.....</b>               | <b>2-1</b> |
| 2.0 Introduction .....                                  | 2-1        |
| 2.1 Alternatives Development Process.....               | 2-1        |
| 2.2 Evaluation Criteria .....                           | 2-2        |
| 2.3 Alternatives Development .....                      | 2-4        |
| 2.3.1 Overview .....                                    | 2-4        |
| 2.3.1.1 Mode.....                                       | 2-4        |
| 2.3.1.2 Alignment.....                                  | 2-4        |
| 2.3.1.3 Logical Termini .....                           | 2-4        |
| 2.3.2 Initial List of Alternatives .....                | 2-5        |
| 2.3.2.1 No Action Alternative .....                     | 2-5        |
| 2.3.2.2 TSM Alternatives.....                           | 2-5        |
| 2.3.2.3 BRT Alternative .....                           | 2-5        |
| 2.3.2.4 Light Rail Alternatives .....                   | 2-5        |
| 2.3.3 Alternatives Screening and Refinement .....       | 2-6        |
| 2.3.3.1 Fatal Flaws Analysis .....                      | 2-6        |
| 2.3.3.2 Refined List of Alternatives.....               | 2-8        |

**Chapter 3: Long List of Alternatives..... 3-1**

3.0 Introduction..... 3-1

3.1 Description of Alternatives..... 3-1

    3.1.1 TSM Alternative..... 3-1

    3.1.2 Light Rail Alternatives..... 3-3

        3.1.2.1 Bayfront Alternatives ..... 3-3

        3.1.2.2 Society Hill Alternatives ..... 3-4

        3.1.2.3 Lincoln Park Alternatives..... 3-6

3.2 Evaluation of Long List Alternatives ..... 3-7

    3.2.1 Project Goal #1—Support existing and proposed development in the West Side community ..... 3-8

    3.2.2 Project Goal #2—Minimize effects on existing and proposed HBLR operations ..... 3-9

    3.2.3 Project Goal #3—Minimize adverse effects on the built and natural environment..... 3-10

3.3 Conclusion ..... 3-11

**Chapter 4: Short List of Alternatives..... 4-1**

4.0 Introduction..... 4-1

4.1 Engineering, Operations, and Environmental Context ..... 4-1

    4.1.1 Engineering Considerations ..... 4-1

        4.1.1.1 Alignment ..... 4-1

        4.1.1.2 Station Planning ..... 4-3

    4.1.2 Capital and Operating and Maintenance Costs ..... 4-3

    4.1.3 Operations Planning..... 4-4

    4.1.4 Ridership Forecasting ..... 4-4

    4.1.5 Environmental Context ..... 4-5

        4.1.5.1 Land Use and Social Conditions ..... 4-5

        4.1.5.2 Natural Resources ..... 4-6

        4.1.5.3 Cultural Resources ..... 4-7

        4.1.5.4 Parklands and Open Space..... 4-8

        4.1.5.5 Visual Resources..... 4-8

        4.1.5.6 Air Quality, Energy, and Greenhouse Gases ..... 4-8

        4.1.5.7 Noise and Vibration..... 4-8

        4.1.5.8 Hazardous Materials ..... 4-8

4.2 Description of Alternatives..... 4-9

    4.2.1 TSM Alternative..... 4-9

        4.2.1.1 Alignment ..... 4-9

        4.2.1.2 Stations..... 4-9

        4.2.1.3 Cost..... 4-10

        4.2.1.4 Operations..... 4-10

        4.2.1.5 Ridership ..... 4-11

        4.2.1.6 Environmental Considerations ..... 4-11

    4.2.2 Alternative 1A: Elevated Extension to Bayfront with One Station..... 4-12

        4.2.2.1 Alignment ..... 4-13

|  |  |            |
|--|--|------------|
| 4.2.2.2                                    | Stations .....   | 4-15       |
| 4.2.2.3                                    | Cost .....   | 4-16       |
| 4.2.2.4                                    | Operations .....   | 4-17       |
| 4.2.2.5                                    | Ridership .....  | 4-17       |
| 4.2.2.6                                    | Environmental Considerations .....   | 4-17       |
| 4.2.3                                      | Alternative 1C: Elevated Extension to Bayfront with Two Stations.....                      | 4-21       |
| 4.2.3.1                                    | Alignment.....   | 4-21       |
| 4.2.3.2                                    | Stations .....   | 4-22       |
| 4.2.3.3                                    | Cost .....   | 4-23       |
| 4.2.3.4                                    | Operations .....   | 4-23       |
| 4.2.3.5                                    | Ridership .....  | 4-24       |
| 4.2.3.6                                    | Environmental Considerations .....   | 4-24       |
| 4.2.4                                      | Alternative 1D: Elevated Extension to Bayfront with Station at Route 440 ...               | 4-26       |
| 4.2.4.1                                    | Alignment.....   | 4-26       |
| 4.2.4.2                                    | Stations .....   | 4-27       |
| 4.2.4.3                                    | Cost .....   | 4-27       |
| 4.2.4.4                                    | Operations .....   | 4-28       |
| 4.2.4.5                                    | Ridership .....  | 4-28       |
| 4.2.4.6                                    | Environmental Considerations .....   | 4-29       |
| 4.3  | Evaluation of Short List Alternatives.....   | 4-31       |
| 4.3.1                                      | Engineering, Cost, Operational, Ridership, and Environmental Considerations .....          | 4-31       |
| 4.3.1.1                                    | TSM Alternative .....  | 4-31       |
| 4.3.1.2                                    | Alternative 1A .....   | 4-31       |
| 4.3.1.3                                    | Alternative 1C .....   | 4-32       |
| 4.3.1.4                                    | Alternative 1D.....  | 4-32       |
| 4.3.2                                      | Consistency with Project Goals and Objectives.....   | 4-32       |
| 4.4  | Conclusion.....  | 4-34       |
| <b>Chapter 5: Public Involvement .....</b> |  | <b>5-1</b> |
| 5.0  | Introduction .....   | 5-1        |
| 5.1  | Public Outreach Program.....   | 5-1        |
| 5.1.1                                      | Approach.....  | 5-2        |
| 5.1.1.1                                    | Targeted Outreach.....   | 5-2        |
| 5.1.1.2                                    | General Outreach .....   | 5-2        |
| 5.1.2                                      | Outreach Materials.....  | 5-2        |
| 5.2  | Public Meetings.....   | 5-3        |
| 5.2.1                                      | Phase 1: Project Initiation.....   | 5-3        |
| 5.2.1.1                                    | Technical Advisory Committee Meeting.....  | 5-3        |
| 5.2.1.2                                    | Public Open House.....   | 5-4        |
| 5.2.2                                      | Phase 2: Development and Refinement of Alternatives .....                                  | 5-4        |
| 5.2.2.1                                    | Technical Advisory Committee Meeting.....  | 5-4        |
| 5.2.2.2                                    | Public Open House.....   | 5-5        |
| 5.2.3                                      | Phase 3: Alternatives Evaluation and Recommendation of Locally Preferred Alternative ..... | 5-6        |

|  |   |            |
|--|---|------------|
| 5.2.3.1  | Technical Advisory Committee Meeting .....                    | 5-6        |
| 5.2.3.2  | Public Open House .....                                       | 5-7        |
| 5.2.3.3  | Public Review of the Draft Alternatives Analysis Report ..... | 5-7        |
| 5.3  | Contact Information .....                                     | 5-9        |
| <b>Chapter 6: Recommendation of the Locally Preferred Alternative.....</b> |   | <b>6-1</b> |
| 6.0  | Introduction.....   | 6-1        |
| 6.1  | Description of the Locally Preferred Alternative.....         | 6-3        |
| 6.2  | Benefits of the Locally Preferred Alternative.....            | 6-3        |
| 6.3  | Cost Effectiveness .....                                      | 6-4        |
| 6.4  | Funding and Financing Opportunities .....                     | 6-5        |
|  | 6.4.1 New Starts/Small Starts Funding.....                    | 6-5        |
|  | 6.4.2 Local Funding.....                                      | 6-5        |
| 6.5  | Public Involvement.....                                       | 6-7        |
| 6.6  | Next Steps .....  | 6-7        |

**Appendices**

- Appendix A: Alignment Drawings for the Long List of Alternatives
- Appendix B: Proposed Modification of Bayfront Street Grid
- Appendix C: Plans and Profiles of the Short List of Alternatives
- Appendix D: Station Plans

## List of Tables

---

|   |      |
|---|------|
| Table 1-1: HBLR Weekday Boardings by Station (October 2010).....  | 1-2  |
| Table 1-2: Journey to Work and Reverse Journey to Work Data for the Study Area.....   | 1-5  |
| Table 1-3: Study Area Population Characteristics .....  | 1-8  |
| Table 1-4: Goals and Objectives .....   | 1-11 |
| Table 2-1: Performance Measures .....   | 2-3  |
| Table 2-2: Initial List of Light Rail Alternatives .....  | 2-6  |
| Table 2-3: Refined Long List of Light Rail Alternatives .....   | 2-8  |
| Table 3-1: TSM Alternatives .....   | 3-2  |
| Table 3-2: Screening of Long List of Alternatives .....   | 3-11 |
| Table 4-1: Cost Estimates for the TSM Alternative .....   | 4-10 |
| Table 4-2: 2035 Daily HBLR Boardings for the TSM Alternative.....   | 4-11 |
| Table 4-3: Environmental Screening Analysis of the TSM Alternative .....  | 4-12 |
| Table 4-4: Cost Estimate for Alternative 1A .....   | 4-17 |
| Table 4-5: 2035 Daily HBLR Boardings for Alternative 1A.....  | 4-18 |
| Table 4-6: Environmental Screening Analysis of Alternative 1A .....   | 4-19 |
| Table 4-7: Cost Estimates for Alternative 1C.....   | 4-23 |
| Table 4-8: 2035 Daily HBLR Boardings for Alternative 1C.....  | 4-24 |
| Table 4-9: Environmental Screening Analysis of Alternative 1C .....   | 4-25 |
| Table 4-10: Cost Estimates for Alternative 1D .....   | 4-28 |
| Table 4-11: 2035 Daily HBLR Boardings for Alternative 1D.....   | 4-28 |
| Table 4-12: Environmental Screening Analysis of Alternative 1D .....  | 4-29 |
| Table 6-1: Comparison of Station Boardings for the No Action Alternative<br>and the Locally Preferred Alternative (Alternative 1A)..... | 6-4  |

## List of Figures

---

|   | <i>Follows Page</i> |
|---|---------------------|
| Figure 1-1: Hudson-Bergen Light Rail System Map.....  | 1-2                 |
| Figure 1-2: Project Setting .....   | 1-4                 |
| Figure 1-3: Existing Bus Service in the Study Area .....  | 1-4                 |
| Figure 1-4: Low-Income and Minority Areas in the Study Area.....  | 1-8                 |
| Figure 1-5: Pedestrian Conditions along Route 440 .....   | 1-10                |
| Figure 2-1: Alternatives Analysis Process.....  | 2-2                 |
| Figure 2-2: Preliminary Concepts for Light Rail Alignments .....  | 2-4                 |
| Figure 3-1: TSM Alternative 1: Realigned 440 Shopper Bus Service.....   | 3-2                 |
| Figure 3-2: TSM Alternative 2: Enhanced Society Hill-Journal Square Bus Service .....   | 3-2                 |
| Figure 3-3: TSM Alternative 3: Circulator Bus Service .....   | 3-2                 |
| Figure 3-4: Alternatives 1A, 1C, and 1D—Bayfront Alternatives .....   | 3-4                 |
| Figure 3-5: Alternatives 2A, 2B, and 2D—Society Hill Alternatives .....   | 3-4                 |
| Figure 3-6: Alternatives 3A, 3B, and 3D—Lincoln Park Alternatives .....   | 3-6                 |
| Figure 4-1: Existing Land Use .....   | 4-6                 |
| Figure 4-2: Future Land Use (ca. 2035).....   | 4-6                 |
| Figure 4-3: Land Ownership: Public and Private Land .....   | 4-6                 |
| Figure 4-4: Wetlands Mapped by National Wetlands Inventory and NJDEP .....  | 4-6                 |
| Figure 4-5: Floodplains.....  | 4-8                 |
| Figure 4-6: Historic Resources .....  | 4-8                 |
| Figure 4-7: Existing and Proposed Publicly Accessible Open Space.....   | 4-8                 |
| Figure 4-8: Future Land Use and FTA Land Use Categories .....   | 4-8                 |
| Figure 4-9: TSM Alternative .....   | 4-10                |
| Figure 4-10: Alternative 1A – Elevated Extension to Bayfront with One Station.....  | 4-14                |
| Figure 4-11: Alternative 1C – Elevated Extension to Bayfront with Two Stations .....  | 4-22                |
| Figure 4-12: Alternative 1D – Elevated Extension to Bayfront with Station at Route 440 .....  | 4-26                |
| Figure 4-13: Engineering, Cost, Operations, Ridership, and Environmental<br>Considerations for the Short List of Alternatives ..... | 4-32                |
| Figure 4-14: Evaluation of Alternatives .....   | 4-34                |